

Hard Questions in Church History

Lynne Hilton Wilson

Law of Plural Marriage: D&C 132

Questions to Consider

- Did Joseph come up with Plural Marriage because he wanted more sex?
- Why did the Lord allow (or direct) Joseph to marry women who were already married?
- Why did Joseph marry women without Emma’s permission?
- Why did Emma have a harder time with this law than other women at the time?
- What about fulfilling Jacob 2, if the goal was posterity, why no children from Joseph?

Timeline

1832-33	Jul-Jul	Joseph translates all of the Old Testament, but the first 24 chapters from 1830. Possibly Joseph asked the Lord about the practice of plural marriage during this time.
1834-1835		An angel commands Joseph to live the Lord’s law of plural marriage; attempt made with Fanny Alger
1842		In Nauvoo plural marriage is taught privately to some apostles
	Jan 5	Joseph opens his Red Brick Store in Nauvoo; waits on customers
	Jan15	First Presidency issues proclamation to “All Saints scattered abroad” to gather to Nauvoo
	Feb	Joseph resumes work on the Egyptian scrolls and Book of Abraham
	Mar 1	Joseph publishes letter written to John Wentworth, editor and proprietor of the <i>Chicago Democrat</i> , in the <i>Times and Seasons</i> ; includes in the publication the History of Joseph Smith, the Articles of Faith, and chapters 1-5 of the Book of Abraham
	Mar 15	Joseph becomes a member of the Free Masons in Nauvoo; Joseph becomes editor of the <i>Times and Seasons</i> newspaper in Nauvoo
	Mar 17	Joseph organizes The Female Relief Society of Nauvoo; his wife Emma is president
	Mar 20	Joseph preaches sermon on the Salvation of Children
	May 4	Endowment given in the Red Brick Store in Nauvoo
	May 6	Former Governor Lilburn W. Boggs is shot by an unknown assailant
	May 19	Joseph is elected Mayor of Nauvoo
	June	An Anti-Mormon political committee is formed in Warsaw, Illinois
	Aug 8	Orrin Porter Rockwell is arrested for complicity in the attempted assassination of Lilburn W. Boggs; Joseph Smith goes into hiding
	Sept	Joseph receives a revelation on ordinance of Baptisms for the Dead (D&C 128)
	Dec 26	Joseph to stand trial in Springfield, Illinois
1843	Jan 5	Joseph is acquitted of all charges in trial before Judge Nathaniel Pope in Springfield, Illinois
	May 26	Hyrum asked about plural marriage earlier, but on this day, at 5:00 pm, Joseph met with Hyrum and others to “receive instructions on the priesthood, the new and everlasting covenant”
	May 28	Sunday, Joseph and Emma sealed for time and all eternity—as well as James and Harriet Adams
	May 29	Sealings of Brigham Young, Hyrum Smith, and Willard Richards to their wives
	June	Four missionaries called to serve in the Pacific Islands
	Jun 11	Joseph taught the purpose of the gathering is to receive temple ordinances

	Jun 13	Joseph + Emma travel 170 miles to Dixon, IL to visit Emma's sister, Mrs. Clara Wasson. Joseph arrested in Dixon, IL for the third time on the same attempt to extradite him on the Missouri shooting of Boggs
	Jun 30	Prophet is found innocent of charges and returns to Nauvoo
	Jul 12	Hyrum insisted that Joseph record the revelation on eternal and plural marriage (D&C 132)
	Jul 16	Joseph preached: Full Salvation Requires Eternal Marriage, “. . . that a man must enter into an everlasting covenant with his wife in this world or he will have no claim on her in the next . . . The fullness of these things ['could not' be 'reveal'] untill the Temple [was] completed” (Ehat, 39)
	Jul 24	Parley P. +Thankful +MaryAnn (+Elizabeth Brotherton) Pratt all sealed for time and all eternity in Hyrum's home
	Aug 6-12	Emma traveled to St. Louis to buy furniture for the nearly finished Mansion House/Hotel
	Aug 12,	D&C 132 recorded and read to Nauvoo Stake High Council. This was very disturbing to Emma and she asked Joseph to relinquish all his plural wives (except the Partridge sisters). Over time, they settled on another plan.

Scriptural Background of Polygamy

~**4000 BC**—“God said unto them [Adam and Eve], ‘Be fruitful, and multiply, and replenish the earth’ (Abraham 5:18). “Therefore shall a man leave his father and his mother, and shall cleave unto his wife, and they shall be one flesh” (Moses 5:2-3). “And Adam knew his wife, and she bare unto him sons and daughters, and they began to multiply and to replenish the earth. And from that time forth, the sons and daughters of Adam began to divide two and two in the land” (See Genesis 1:28; Moses 2:28; Abraham 4:28; D&C 132:62).

~**600 BC**—“David and Solomon truly had many wives and concubines, which thing was abominable before me, saith the Lord” (Jacob 2:24). “For there shall not any man among you have save it be one wife; and concubines he shall have none (Jacob 2:27). “For if I will, saith the Lord of Hosts, raise up seed unto me, I will command my people; otherwise they shall hearken unto these things” (Jacob 2:24).

~**AD 30-33**—“For in the resurrection they neither marry, nor are given in marriage, but are as the angels” (Matt 22:30).

December 30, 1830—Joseph Smith completes the Joseph Smith Translation to Genesis 24, paused for a few months. Then begins translating the New Testament.

1831—“Thou shalt love thy wife with all thy heart and cleave unto her and none else” (D&C 42:22).

1831—“Marriage is ordained of God unto man . . . it is lawful that he should have one wife, and they twain shall be one flesh, and all this that the earth might answer the end of its creation” (D&C 49:15-16).

1832—“Who overcome by faith, and are sealed by the Holy Spirit of promise . . . are priests and kings, who have received of his fulness, and of his glory” (D&C 76:56). This is the first time Joseph learned of the sealing by the Holy Spirit of Promise. The phrase “Holy Spirit of Promise” is always used in scripture to designate a sealing ordinance. The New Testament includes the phrase once (Eph 1:17). The Doctrine and Covenants includes the phrase seven times (D&C 76:53; 88:3; 124:124; 132:7, 18, 19, 26). Six of the seven references are to a permanent sealing.

July 20, 1832-July 7, 1833—Joseph Smith Translation of the Bible, from John 7 through Malachi finished; Fredrick G. Williams acts as scribe for most of the Old Testament.

1836—Joseph Smith receives sealing keys from Elijah; opens the way for the restoration of sealing ordinances (D&C 110).

1843—“In order to obtain the highest, a man must enter into . . . the new and everlasting covenant of marriage” (D&C 131:1, 3).

1843—D&C 132—Revelation written on eternal marriage and plural marriage. First half discusses eternal marriage, and second half plural marriage (though revealed earlier, probably when translating the Old Testament)

Joseph’s Introduction to Plural Marriage

The Lord asked the Prophet Joseph Smith to see the world differently on many subjects—revelation, repentance, the gift of the Holy Ghost, gifts of the Spirit, temples, and pre-and post-mortal life. The Lord asked him to change some doctrines that ran counter-cultural to most of Christianity including—the trinity, depravity of man, baptism, scripture, priesthood ordinations, women, covenants election, and ordinances. Joseph characteristically obeyed immediately. “Go tell your Dad,” and he did. “Move to Kirtland,” and he did. “Build a temple,” and he did. “Don’t fight,” and he did not fight the Missourians. This was not the case when he received the revelation to enter into the law of plural marriage. He was horrified.

While translating the Bible, we know of Joseph asked several questions that brought beautiful revelations (like Moses 1-7; D&C 76; and Matthew 24). Probably between July 1832 and July 1833, when Joseph translated nearly all of the Old Testament (Genesis 25 to Malachi 4), Joseph asked a question that is referenced in D&C 132:1,

As you have inquired of my hand to know and understand wherein I, the Lord, justified my servants Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, as also Moses, David and Solomon, my servants, as touching the principle and doctrine of their having many wives . . . [I] will answer thee . . .

The Lord’s answer to the young prophet included the most difficult commandment that he received from God. I contend that plural marriage was the hardest trial of faith for the Prophet Joseph. Living it became an Abrahamic sacrifice for him.

Many doctrines the Lord restored through the Prophet Joseph attacked the cultural norm of nineteenth-century-Christianity. But plural marriage also violated the Lord’s moral, and the nations legal laws. Several religious seekers of the day returned to the Bible to find the primitive church (like Alexander Campbell and his followers), but they did not attempt to adopt polygamy. A few religious traditions adopted uncommon sexual practices (including Mother Ann Lee and her followers, or John Humphrey Noyes and the Oneida Community), but they were seen as extremists and most of these American traditions died out. Even though polygamy was practiced in the Bible, the practice was unacceptable to most of America’s religious society. We will take a brief look at Joseph’s reluctance and eventual practice of plural marriage.

Joseph’s Reticence to the Law of Plural Marriage

Joseph did not want to obey the law of plural marriage—it was repulsive to him initially. We see this from written records and the fact that it took him years to implement and record it. Harder than violating the societal norms, plural marriage offended Emma. Joseph had a tender relationship with his wife as we can read in their love letters and other people’s reports (*josephsmithpapers.org*). He did not want to offend her. But God was persistent, and he finally agreed to follow the best he could.

In addition to offending Emma, He had lived through much persecution and knew this would also offend his friends, let alone his enemies. After much anguish, the Lord softened his heart, and Joseph accepted God’s order.

From extant records, it appears that it took years before the Prophet Joseph Smith implemented and recorded the doctrine of plural marriage. His reasons are obscured. Historical records suggest that he entered the law of plural marriage with one woman in 1835 or 1836 in Kirtland and over thirty women in Nauvoo between “early 1841 and the fall of 1843” (Steven Harper, *Making Sense of the Doctrine and Covenants: A Guided Tour Through Modern Revelation* [Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 2008], 481).

In the three years that Joseph actively attempted to live the law of plural marriage, it led to persecution within and without the church. Due to living the law of plural marriage, the Prophet was accused of being oversexed, disloyal to his wife, and taking advantage of young women. To date, I have not seen evidence for these accusations. It should be noted that the Prophet Joseph did not accept the law until an angel came to him three times—the last time carrying a drawn sword and threatening to remove him from his place. It was then that he moved forward.

The Lord Prepared Women and Men

The records suggest that an angel gave Joseph the names of the women he was to ask to be sealed. Each woman he approached, he asked them to pray and receive their own spiritual witness before agreeing to the marriage. In 1882 Joseph F. Smith printed in the *Deseret News*, “The Lord showed him [Joseph] those women who were to engage with him in the establishment of that principle in the Church, and at that time some of these women were named and given to him, to become his wives when the time should come that this principle should be established” (Brian C. Hales and Laura H. Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy: Toward a Better Understanding* 4 vols. [Sandy, UT: Greg Kofford Books, 2013-2018], 1:224). Although Joseph F. Smith’s record is a later memory, his account is consistent with accounts of plural wives and family journals.

Angel appears Three Times (1834, 1840, 1842)

There are twenty-one extant accounts that tell of an angel revealing the doctrine of plural marriage to the Prophet Joseph. From these accounts, it appears that angels explained the commandment, answered Joseph’s questions, encouraged him. When the angel returned for the third time in Nauvoo, he carried a “drawn sword,” and threatened to replace Joseph. It appears that the first of these angelic visitations occurred in Kirtland between 1834 and 1835. The last one probably was in Nauvoo. Twenty of the recorded accounts that describe the angel were written after the martyrdom of the Prophet. The following are examples of these accounts:

- 1) *Emily D. Partridge*: “Joseph Smith told me that the angel had appeared to him and had given him that revelation” (Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:196).

- 2) *Mary Elizabeth Rollins Lightner*: “Joseph told me that he was afraid when the angel appeared to him and told him to take other wives. He hesitated, and the angel appeared to him the third time with a drawn sword in his hand and threatened his life if he did not fulfill the commandment.” Later she said gave the date of the “drawn sword” as February 1842 (Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:192, 196).
- 3) *Joseph Bates Noble* (recorded 3 memories): “In the fall of the year A.D. 1840 Joseph Smith taught him the principle of Celestial marriage or a ‘plurality of wives,’ and that the said Joseph Smith declared [*sic*] that he had received a Revelation from God on the subject, and that the Angel of the Lord had commanded him [Joseph Smith] to move forward in the said order of marriage.” Later in 1880, he again, “spoke of Joseph unfolding to him the eternity of the marriage covenant to convince him of the truth of which was no small matter—Joseph bore testimony that he had received a revelation on this principle in Kirtland but the Lord told him ‘not yet.’ The angel of the Lord came to him in Nauvoo and told him the time had come.” He repeated a similar statement in 1883 (Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:196-197).
- 4) *Eliza R. Snow* told her brother Lorenzo Snow in 1843, “Prophet Joseph unbosomed [*sic*] his heart and described the trying mental ordeal he experienced in overcoming the repugnance of his feelings, the natural result of the force of education and social custom, relative to the introduction of plural marriage. He knew the voice of God—he knew the commandment of the Almighty to him was to go forward, to set the example, and establish celestial plural marriage. He knew that he had not only his own prejudices and prepossessions to combat and to overcome, but those of the whole Christian world; but God, who is above all, had given the commandment, and He must be obeyed. Yet the Prophet hesitated and deferred from time to time, until an angel of God stood by him with a drawn sword, and told him that, unless he moved forward and established plural marriage, his priesthood would be taken from him and he should be destroyed!” (Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:215).
- 5) On August 18, 1869, then apostle Joseph F. Smith recorded in an affidavit that “an angel from heaven appeared before him with a drawn sword, threatening him with destruction unless he went forward and obeyed the commandment” (*Mormon Historical Studies*, vol. 11; no. 2, 2010).

D&C 132:36: Plural Marriage was Joseph’s Abrahamic Sacrifice

I define an “Abrahamic Sacrifice” as God asking for a short-term detour of His previous law to obey personal revelation. It is also the hardest commandment to obey because it requires the giving up of an individualized tailor-made sacrifice; often it is the hardest thing to give up for each person.

When a disciple has proven worthy of following God’s law, the Lord takes one of His most treasured truths and asks the individual to give it up. Because of the personal nature of the sacrifice, it requires knowledge of God’s commandments and personal revelation. It requires the individual to follow a living, present, revealed revelation in the face of breaking the tried and tested revelation of scripture. It is learning to say, “Thy will not mine.”

After the sacrifice, the Lord asks the individual to return to living His law again. One of Joseph’s plural wives, Zina Huntington, referred to plural marriage as “a greater sacrifice than to give my life .

. . [but] I obtained a testimony for myself that God had required that order” (Zina Huntington Young quote, in Harper, *Making Sense of the Doctrine and Covenants*, 482).

The first half of D&C 132 (starting with verse 4), the Lord introduces the law of eternal marriage. He then retells the story of Abraham’s sacrifice of Isaac; after which he asks Joseph to live the law of plural marriage. I think these can be read as distinct. One of Joseph’s plural wives recorded him saying, “The practice of this principle would be the hardest trial the Saints would ever have to test their faith” (Harper, *Making Sense of the Doctrine and Covenants*, 481).

Plural Marriage Theologically

Even though examples of plural marriage are mentioned in the Old Testament, and it was still practiced at the time of the New Testament, nevertheless, living in Joseph’s era, the law of plural marriage was fraught with personal attacks. Critics claim that the practice was unfair to women, a lifestyle for cultures with oversexed and controlling men. None of the accusations fit into the historical setting of Joseph Smith. The restored theology suggests just the opposite.

From an eternal perspective, the doctrine of plural marriage says women have an easier chance of gaining eternal exaltation than men. But Christ restored that He is no respecter of persons—nor gender, race, age, etc.. If we take into consideration there were more male babies born than female babies and that by childhood the numbers are about even—the numbers suggest the God planned for the Edenic law to pair off two by two. The Book of Jacob explains that the law of plural marriage is given at certain times for those who are to raise up seed to the Lord (Jacob 2:24). We also learn in D&C 132 that some will live plural marriage in heaven. However, that is not a requirement according to our scriptures. It is helpful to read D&C 132 realizing that much of it is talks about sealing, and not plural marriage.

History of Marriages and Sealings

Joseph taught celestial marriage openly, but did not speak publicly about the law of plural marriage except in a rare, obscure, tangential reference only understood by a few. Here are a few examples of hints that suggest the prophet knew something about eternal sealings of marriage by the mid-1830s:

May 1835

W.W. Phelps wrote his wife, “A new idea, Sally, if you and I continue faithful to the end, we are certain of being one in the Lord throughout eternity; This is one of the most glorious consolations we can have in the flesh.”

May 5, 1835

Emma signed her letter to Joseph, “Yours forever.”

November 24, 1835

The Prophet Joseph performed the marriage of Lydia Goldthwaite Bailey and Newel Knight. In the Newel Knight Journal, there is no mention of a marriage beyond this life. Newel wrote,

We received much Instruction from the Prophet concerning matrimony, & what the ancient order of God was, & by the authority of t 0.25"he priesthood which he held, he joined us in the bond of matrimony on Tuesday.” —Joseph: “You covenant to be each others companions

through life, and discharge the duties of husband & wife in every respect to which they assented, I then pronounced them husband & Wife in the name of God” (Newel Knight Journal, as cited in Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:198-200).

Jan 20, 1836

Joseph officiated in the marriage of John Boynton and Susan Lowell and recorded, “I pronounced upon them the blessings of Abraham, Isaac, and Jacob, and such other blessings as the Lord put into my heart . . . I doubt whether the pages of history can boast of a more splendid and innocent wedding and feast than this, for it was conducted after the order of heaven” (Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:201).

April 3, 1836

Elijah gave Joseph Smith and Oliver Cowdery keys of the sealing power (D&C 110:14-16).

November 4, 1838

Joseph signed his letter to Emma, “I am yours forever, your husband”

1840 or 1841

Joseph taught a few Church leaders the law of plural marriage.

July 12, 1842

Joseph dictated to his scribe a commandment on eternal and plural marriages (D&C 132).

May 1843

Joseph and Emma were sealed for time and eternity.

September 1843

Joseph and Emma received the crowning ordinance of exaltation (D&C 132:7-10).

April 8, 1844

Two months before the Prophet Joseph’s death, his brother Hyrum Smith openly taught *eternal marriage* in Nauvoo:

I married me a wife, and I am the only one who had any right to her. We had five children, the covenant was made for our lives. She fell into the grave before God showed us his order. God has shown me that his covenant is dead, and had no force, neither could I have her in the resurrection, but we should be as the angels—it troubled me. President Joseph said you can have her sealed to you upon the same principles as you can be baptized for the dead. I enquired what can I do for any second wife? You can also make a covenant with her for eternity and have her sealed to you by the authority of the priesthood. I named the subject to my present wife, and she said, ‘I will act as proxy for your wife that is dead, and I will be sealed to you for eternity myself for I never had any other husband. I love you and I do not want to be separate from you nor be forever alone in the world to come.’ . . . What honest man or woman can find fault with such a doctrine as this? None. It is a doctrine not to be preached to the world; but to the Saints who have obeyed the gospel and gathered to Zion. It is glad tidings of great joy” (Hyrum Smith quote, in Hales and Hales, *Joseph Smith’s Polygamy*, 1:213).

Misunderstandings

The law of plural marriage was often misunderstood by those in and out of the Church. Several early Saints believed that being sealed to the Prophet Joseph Smith ensured exaltation for them and their families, if not in this world, then in celestial glory. Brethren came to Joseph asking if their whole families could be joined to his. Another misunderstanding was that being sealed to Joseph was a Church calling most often given to those who had financial, emotional, and spiritual sensitivity.

During the Prophet Joseph's life time, it is estimated that about one hundred Latter-day Saints were involved in plural marriage relationships. Over the next few decades, one estimate claims 4% of the men were called to live in a plural marriage relationship (Institute Manual, *Church History*, 424). If we count wives and children that percentage rises significantly. Later numbers rise a larger percentage of the Utah population due to the large number of children involved.

Joseph and Emma Smith did not record their personal experience with living the law. From what we do know, it was very difficult for both of them. It is sad to see our culture, which blatantly breaks the law of chastity before and after marriage and finds pleasure in looking at naked men and women and even makes access to such images available to youth, that has the audacity to denounce the Prophet Joseph as an adulterer or sex fiend.

Like Father Abraham, the Prophet Joseph was commanded by God to live another form of marriage for a short period of time. Furthermore, Joseph it was biblical and he was to restore all things. He thought the Second Coming was soon and the Lord would clarify his laws then. Finally, I think it was easier to initially understand and except for those who had lost their first wife, like Hyrum and Brigham, who hoped to have both their current and past beloved wives with them in heaven.

Why is there no offspring from the union of Joseph Smith and his plural wives?

Even though twelve children have been attributed by various informants as Joseph's offspring (outside of his nine children with his wife Emma Smith), with DNA and historical testing, only one of the twelve, Josephine Lyons, had the potential of being a living offspring of Joseph. But even in this case, it is hard to tell as the next generation married into Smith bloodlines. Most evidence suggests Joseph only had offspring with Emma (Ugo A. Perego, "Joseph Smith, the Question of Polygamous Offspring, and DNA Analysis," in Craig Foster and Newell Bringhurst, ed. *The Persistence of Polygamy* [Independence, MO: John Whitmer Books, 2010]).

Why did Joseph wed married women?

D&C 132:41-45. Two explanations have surfaced: 1) Some say this law is for the next life only and 2) Some of the women were married to non-believing men so the eternal hope of a sealing had an additional impact on them. Some people have speculated at least two plausible ideas. First, by marrying someone for the next life only, it may have been easier on Emma if she knew Joseph would be having no intimate relations now. Second, perhaps the angel gave Joseph the names of the women when they were single. By the time Joseph finally acted on it, it was easier to just stick with the same woman and say—"An angel gave me your name, just pray about it . . . no need to worry about anything in this life, stay with your husband, but in the future, your family can be sealed eternally to mine . . . if you get an answer." Without Joseph or Emma's statements we do not know.

Why did Joseph practice the law of plural marriage without his wife Emma's consent?

Doctrine and Covenants 132:64-65 explains the “Law of Sarah” and encourages Emma Smith to facilitate living the law. Joseph is promised that he and Emma are sealed eternally regardless of her acceptance of the law (D&C 132:49; 109:68-69). The Lord told the Prophet Joseph, “I have seen your sacrifices in obedience to that which I have told you. Go, therefore, and I make a way for your escape, as I accepted the offering of Abraham of his son” (D&C 132:50).

Joseph Smith Plural Sealings and Proposals

One in Kirtland, all others in Nauvoo (Chart adapted from Hales, Joseph Smith’s Polygamy, 1:428)

	Name of Wife	Sealing Date	Legal Husband	Sexuality
0.	Fanny Alger (<i>possible proposal</i>)	? (if any, after 4/1836)	later	?
1.	Louisa Beaman	April 5, 1841	none	yes
	<i>Sarah Bates Pratt (Proposal)</i>	July 1841	Orson Pratt	
2.	Lucinda Pendleton	<July, 1841>	George Harris	
3.	Zina Huntington*	Oct 1841	Henry B. Jacobs	no
4.	Presendia Huntington*	Dec 11, 1841	Norman Buell	no
5.	Agnes Moulton Coolbirth	Jan 6, 1842	[widow]	
	<i>Sarah Granger Kimball (Proposal)</i>	Early 1842	Hiram Kimball	

Angel Visit Early February 1842

6.	Mary Elizabeth Rollins*	Late February 1842	Adam Lightner	
7.	Patty Bartlett*	March 9, 1842	David Sessions	
8.	Marinda Nancy Johnson*	April 1842	Orson Hyde	

April 1842 - Shift in Joseph’s Plural Proposals

	<i>Nancy Rigdon (Proposal)</i>			
9.	Delcena Johnson	<July, 1842>		
10.	Eliza R. Snow	June 29, 1842	possible	
11.	Sarah Ann Whitney	July 27, 1842	[1843, Joseph Kingsbury]	possible
12.	Martha McBride	August 1842		
13.	Sylvia Sessions	Early 1843	[Windsor Lyon]	?
14.	Ruth Vose	February 1843	Edwards Sayers	
15.	Flora Woodworth	Spring 1843		
16.	Emily Dow Partridge#		March 4, 1843	yes
17.	Eliza Maria Partridge#	March 8, 1843	yes	
18.	Almera Woodard Johnson	April 1843	yes	
19.	Lucy Walker	May 1, 1843	yes	
20.	Sarah Lawrence#	May 1843	yes	
21.	Maria Lawrence#	May 1843	yes	
22.	Helen Mar Kimball	May 1843		
23.	Hannah Ells	mid-year 1843	possible	
24.	Elivira Annie Cowles	June 1, 1843	Jonathan Holmes	
25.	Rhoda Richards	June 12, 1843		
26.	Desdemona Fullmer	July 1843		
27.	Olive G. Frost	Summer 1843	yes	
28.	Malissa Lott	September 20, 1843	yes	
29.	Fanny Young	November 2, 1843		
30.	Nancy M. Winchester		?	
31.	Elizabeth Davis	?	Jabez Durfee	
32.	Sarah Kingsley*		John Cleveland	
33.	Esther Dutcher		Albert Smith	
34.	Mary Hero		[John Snider]	yes

Emma's choice

* sealed for eternity only

Following Strict Laws

Joseph was very scrupulous about not performing marriage illegally under Ohio law. According to The state had updated their marriage laws in 1824 and held to them. The prophet was careful because at one point Sidney Rigdon was in legal trouble for not having a license to perform marriages, without his Campbellite ministerial license. Furthermore, the Ohio legal punishment for bigamy or polygamy was very high—including imprisonment of offending parties—including the one performing any such marriage. In December 1833, the Lord revealed D&C 101 that states that the church does not practice plural marriage. (approximately \$1000 and a couple years in the penitentiary, for all).

Each man was to be called to live plural marriage, and not a choice they could act on of their own wishes. After Joseph Smith's death, Brigham Young excommunicated people for adultery who practiced plural marriage without being called to do so; “[N]o man can have the 2nd woman unless he ha[s] the consent of the man who holds the sealing power . . .” (*Minutes of the Apostles of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1835-1893*, Salt Lake City: Privately Published 2010, 130).

Sources:

Gospel Topics Essays (<https://www.churchofjesuschrist.org/study/manual/gospel-topics-essays/plural-marriage-in-the-church-of-jesus-christ-of-latter-day-saints?lang=eng>); Brian C. Hales and Laura H. Hales, *Joseph Smith's Polygamy: Toward a Better Understanding* 4 vols. (Sandy, UT: Greg Kofford Books, 2013-2018); https://www.fairmormon.org/answers/Mormonism_and_polygamy; B. Carmon Hardy, “Lords of Creation: Polygamy, the Abrahamic Household, and Mormon Patriarchy,” *Journal of Mormon History* 20, no. 1 (Spring 1994): 119-152; Richard Lyman Bushman, *Rough Stone Rolling* (NY: Vintage Books, 2005); Jill Mulvay Derr and Matthew J. Grow, “Letters on Mormon Polygamy and Progeny: Eliza R. Snow and Martin Luther Holbrook, 1866-1869,” *BYU Studies* 48, no. 2 (2009); Steven Harper, *Making Sense of the Doctrine and Covenants: A Guided Tour through Modern Revelation* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 2008), 480-489. M. Scott Bradshaw “Performing Legal Marriages in Ohio 1835” in Gordon A. Madsen, Jeffrey N. Walker, and John W. Welch, ed., *Sustaining the Law: Joseph Smith's Legal Encounters* (Provo, UT: BYU Studies, 2014), chap. 8.