



Type: Book Chapter

Part 7: A "Report Card" for Evaluating Models

Author(s): John L. Sorenson

Source: *The Geography of Book of Mormon Events: A Source Book*

Published by: Provo, UT; FARMS, 1990

Page(s): 356-364



Part 7
A “Report Card”
for Evaluating Models

“Report Card”

“Grade”

(A-D, as in academics;
F, failed; ?, unknown;
NA, not applicable)

Criteria	A	B	C	D	F	?	NA
0.1 Tropical climate							
0.2 No drastic changes in nature required							
0.3 Writing evidence							
0.4 Not based on naive linguistic comparisons							
0.5 Archaeological evidence for cities and large population							
Of the proper dates							
0.51 Not based on assumptions about particular archaeological sites/cultures being particular Book of Mormon groups							
0.6 Not based on unrealistic population increases							
0.7 Not based on assumption that Moroni buried his plates in the hill of the final battle							
0.8 Not dependent on “literal” modern English reading of geographical terms in text							
0.9 Not dependent on statements by Church authorities							
1. Land southward nearly surrounded w. water South extremity Nephi of First Inherit. Length on the order of 300 miles Max. width considerably less than 300 miles							
1.1 Most general Nephi from west sea to east sea General Nephi for most purposes highland							
1.11 Local land Nephi less than 20 mi. diameter Descending elevation: Nephi, Shilom, Shemlon Shemlon clearly visible from city Nephi West sea under 50 miles from city Nephi							
1.111 Nephi—the major regional center for centuries Walled, during 2nd-3d cent. B.C.							

Criteria	A	B	C	D	F	?	NA
1.191 Sebus body of water, single access point							
1.2 Continuous lowland strip ca. 300 mi. N-S Part close enough to Nephi to be "in" N. Separated from Sidon basin by mtn. chain							
1.21 Southernmost part of west wilderness							
1.22 Part of west wilderness near Shemlon							
1.3 Toward east sea borders where N. met Z. Across elevation from Antionum							
2-1. Consists of watershed; Sidon flows northerly Off one or more established routes, travelers suffered hunger, thirst, extreme fatigue Center ca. 10(?) days (100 mi.?) from city Nephi Continuous with lowland wildernesses, E. and W.							
2. Basically the Sidon river basin Largely on west of the river Sometime also included borders by east sea area Evident as heart/center of general land of Z.							
2.11 Local land mainly up/down river ca. 20 mi. total							
2.111 Conceived as a "great city" 1st cent. B.C. Earth-walled 1st cent. B.C. On west bank of river Sidon							
2.112 Crucial crop area on west bank upstream of city							
2.113 Ford over river few miles upstream of city							
2.114 Hill east of river withn few miles of city Flatish top, battle fought there and continuously from there up to Gideon							
2.115 Hill, within a few miles, scene of ritual execution							
2.12 Part (salient or exclave) of west wilderness Reached within ten miles of local Zarahemla							
2.21 Downstream from Z., well beyond local land of Z., heavy population dwelt							
2.22 Only stream mentioned in land of Z., stood out Head was up in narrow strip (south wilderness) Probably debouched via deltaic borders/east sea							
2.221 An area downriver from Zarahemla Populous (prob. same as "most capital parts" Prob. chiefly on west side of the Sidon river							
2.222 Distinct area with cities Prob. downriver from Zarahemla Prob. same as 2.221							

Criteria

A B C D F ? NA

- 2.3 Mountain basin/valley
Probably fairly smooth as route to Manti through
Ca. 15 mi. southeasterly from city Zarahemla
Ca. 15 mi. northeasterly from Minon
- 2.4 Southernmost settled land on river
Narrow strip rose directly above Manti
Usual route to Zar. was over via Gideon valley
40-60 miles from Zarahemla
Predictable entry route from east out of wilder.
- 2.41 On river between Manti and Zarahemla
Ca. 20-25 mi. upriver from city of Zarahemla
- 2.42 Hill immediately south of route/tributary coming
in from east to the Sidon a bit above Manti
- 2.43 West of Sidon in general Manti sector
Controlled routes down from Antiparah, Cumeni
blocking access to Zarahemla and Melek
Small area, garrison city only, not a signif. land
- 2.44 West of Manti facing narrow strip of wilderness
Higher elevation than Judea and Manti
Lower than Antiparah and Cumeni
Minor area, garrison city only
- 2.45 Garrison city only
Faced narrow strip of wilderness
Between Antiparah and Zeezrom
Separate routes from it to Manti and Judea
- 2.46 Garrison city, little or no land about
Faced narrow strip of wilderness
Highest elevation, probably in or near a pass
Beyond, to west, was a city in borders/west sea
Judea to Antiparah only scores of miles
- 2.47 From Antiparah to city in borders/west sea only
limited (20-40?) mileage
- 2.48 Westerly from Zara.
Near, along base of mountain edge of Sidon basin
Inaccessible from lowland west wilderness
Route from Zara. went across some elevation
Judea directly accessible from Melek
No city but productive region
- 2.51 Along west mountain edge of Sidon basin
Ca. 40-50 miles northerly from Melek
City in some depression (?)
From here routes led to Noah, Sidom, Aaron
All those farther inland than Ammonihah

--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Criteria

A B C D F ? NA

2.52	Ca. 20-40 miles from Ammonihah Easterly or southeasterly (?) from A.						
2.53	A direct trip from Ammonihah inland Easterly or northeasterly (?) Nephihah farther east than Aaron Prob. in about the middle of the land E-W						
2.54	Populous (relatively extensive lands?) Prob. adjacent to river Sidon						
2.55	Generally NW of Zarahemla, unknown distance But short of the west coastal lowland Poor defensive position (no city mentioned)						
2.56	Same sector as land of David, maybe in it						
2.60	Originally (i.e., ecologically) extended to near narrow neck Distance from narrow pass to Moroni ca. 70 mi.						
2.61	On coastal plain by east sea Sank beneath sea waters Small area with wilderness on east, south Anchor of Ne. defensive line on southeast Adjacent (20? mi.) to Nephihah Near (15? mi.) Morianton and Lehi						
2.611	Nearly bordering upon the seashore South beyond Moroni and the later-defended south boundary line with the Lamanites Staging ground for Lam. attack on Moroni At least one hill One crossed an elevation to reach Jershon area Farther southward was Siron To go there required crossing a further elevation From here to head of the Sidon was round about And weeks of travel						
2.6111	Hill near Antionum's city Of unknown elevation but a crowd could be atop						
2.62	General borders/east sea area Regional center Inland from Moroni, Morianton, Lehi Ca. 10-15(?) mi. from Morianton, Lehi Route from Zara. shared part way by Lam. from Nephi to Morianton Nephihah to Manti over an elevation Nearer midpoint of land southward was Aaron Farther southward and inland than Omner						

Criteria

A B C D F ? NA

- 2.63 Settled as a garrison city
In east sea borders, down by the seashore in comparison with Nephiah
Built "in a special manner"
Ca. 8(?) mi. from Morianton
Lehi nearer camp of Moroni than Morianton
- 2.64 Settled as a garrison city
Route "down by the seashore" ran fairly straight from here to Bountiful to narrow pass
- 2.65 Down by the east seashore
Northward from Morianton
Unknown distance, prob. 15-30 mi. from Morian.
Small garrison city, prob. limited land
- 2.66 Northward from Omner
Unknown distance, prob. 15-30 mi. from Omner
Down by the east seashore
Inland from Mulek, so Bountiful to Omner trip could go via either city equally
Garrison city, no land mentioned
- 2.67 Prob. Mulekites' first settlement
Down by the east seashore, within a few miles
Perhaps particularly isolated, defensible
Less than 15 mi. direct line to Bountiful
Northward from Omner
- 2.68 South of Bountiful
Moroni's base for activity all way to border of Antionum (50-100? mi.)
Inland from Omner, Morianton, Gid
- 2.681 "Over" from Lehi
On different route to narrow pass than seashore
- 2.7 North extension of coastal lowlands of land of Ne.
Accessible at few points from land of Zarahemla
- 2.71 Northerly portion of west coastal wilderness
Northwestward from Zarahemla, David, Angola
Strongly defensible
- 2.72 In center of then-occupied Nephite lands
Elevated
Isolated, besiegable
Large enough to hold many thousand people
- 2.721 At south boundary of greater Bountiful
Highly defensible, constricted zone by west sea?

A	B	C	D	F	?	NA

Criteria

A B C D F ? NA

2.8	Abuts land of Desol. on a line (river?) The two connect by narrow pass/passage Primary Nephite concern toward east sea side But general land B. came near crossing n. neck						
2.801	Isthmus between east sea and west sea And connecting l. southward with l. northward						
2.802	Within narrow neck Toward east sea side South entrance is at Bountiful-Desolation line A single, known, defensible point Pass as such is within the land of Desolation No group access whatever by land to Nephite land northward except via the narrow pass						
2.81	Land=area immed. around the city, fortif. round it Strategic for defense of neck from east sea attack Not strategic against attack via west sea side Which may mean city is at least 15 mi. from pass						
2.811	Close to east sea beach Nearest city on the south, Mulek Gid also near, directly on the south						
2.812	West sea side of narrow neck Near (not in?) both/either Bountiful or Desolation More sheltered than mere beach						
3.1	Minimum 200 miles long, surely part of an ocean Adjacent to lands southward, northward and neck						
3.2	Nephites quite surely crossed Pacific=west sea Minimum 400 miles long						
3.3	Used only in reference to land northward						
3.4	Used only in reference to land northward						
4.	Nephite land northward primarily toward east Final wars concerned only toward east side West sea voyages also to land northward No indication Nephites settled (Jaredite) uplands Width unknown but neck constriction notable						
4.1	Localized southern part, adjacent to Bountiful Deforested, Neph. believed, by Jaredite populat. Narrow pass per se lay within Desolation Uncertain if Desolation reached the west sea						
4.11	In the pass; only approached from south via it Ca. 10-20 mi. easterly was Teancum, by sea						

